Day - 1 27 May 2019

Agenda Item 1: Welcome address by Mr. Vitor Caldeira, President, Tribunal de Contas (Host SAI)

The 16th meeting of the INTOSAI Compliance Audit Subcommittee (CAS) was held in Lisbon, Portugal during 27-28 May 2019 and was hosted by the Tribunal de Contas, SAI of Portugal. Representatives from 17 SAIs participated in the meeting, apart from observers AFROSAI – E and IDI. The list of participants is annexed. Mr. Vitor Caldeira, President of Tribunal de Contas welcomed the participants to Lisbon and emphasized the need for compliance audit in fulfilling the mandate of SAIs and the importance of standards in ensuring transparency and effectiveness in the functioning of SAIs. He also advised the members to keep track of propriety issues while carrying out compliance audits.

Agenda Item 2: Opening remarks and report on activities of CAS since last meeting held in Luxembourg by Mr. V. Kurian, Chair of CAS & Additional Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General, SAI India

Mr. V. Kurian, Chair of CAS welcomed the participants to the 16th meeting of the CAS and thanked the SAI, Portugal for hosting the meeting. He briefed the members about the activities of CAS since the last meeting in Luxembourg in 2018 and introduced the agenda of the 16th CAS meeting. He thanked all the members for their continued cooperation and support in meeting the objectives of CAS and expressed confidence that the 16th meeting would be a success like the earlier meetings.

Agenda Item 3: Approval of minutes of the 15th meeting of CAS held in Luxembourg during 9-10 October 2018

Minutes of the 15th meeting of CAS held in Luxembourg were considered and adopted.

Agenda Item 4: Presentation on Project 2.2 of Strategic Development Plan (SDP) of INTOSAI Framework for Professional Pronouncements (IFPP) on ‘GUID4900’

Ms. Ingvild Gulbrandsen, Project Leader, SAI Norway made a detailed presentation on the progress of Project 2.2 of SDP of IFPP on ‘GUID 4900’ (Providing guidance on compliance audit). She shared the feedback received from the IFPP on the draft GUID 4900 and the
consequent additions made to the Exposure draft since the last CAS meeting. The presentation is attached.

During discussions the members suggested changes to the exposure draft and it was also decided to give further comments, if any, by the members within the next couple of days to enable the project leader to incorporate these before the revised draft is sent to the FIPP.

**Agenda Item 5: Discussion on Dashboard Reporting on activities of CAS to INTOSAI Governing Board**

Agenda items 2.2 and 2.3 of Dashboard report and Cross-cutting priority 4 pertain to CAS. The members deliberated on these issues and felt that, as regards item 2.2, there is a risk that timeline for project completion i.e. 31 August 2019 may extend marginally since the exposure draft can be placed in public domain only after FIPP considers it. As for item 2.3, since the project timelines as per the revised project proposal are subject to final approval by FIPP, it was felt that, there is a risk of shifting timelines for the project. However, the Project Team Leader expressed confidence that it may be possible to meet the final target date for the project. The status of Dashboard report is attached.

**Agenda Item 6: Presentation and discussion on progress in CAS Project 2.3 of SDP of IFPP on ‘Using ISSAIs in accordance with the SAI’s mandate and carrying out combined audits’**

Ms. Cristina Breden, Project Leader, SAI Romania made a detailed presentation on CAS Project 2.3 of SDP of IFPP on ‘Using ISSAIs in accordance with the SAI’s mandate and carrying out combined audits’. The presentation is attached.

Ms. Cristina mentioned that FIPP had asked for a revised project proposal within the following week, with clarity on the purpose of the guide and amend the structure with the conclusions of the needs assessment. She stated that the response for the survey was not as per the targeted timeline as the participation of some member SAIs was not very encouraging, but expressed confidence that the overall project timeline would be achieved. Considering the vast scope of the project, various sub-working groups have been formed to work on different aspects of the project. The members also suggested changes to the revised draft proposal and further authorised the Project Leader to make necessary changes, if required, based on further information, if any, received by her.
Agenda Item 7: Presentation by SAI Azerbaijan on Compliance Audit of the Project of Improvement of Population's Drinking Water Supply

Ms. Narmina Isayeva from SAI Azerbaijan made a presentation on compliance audit of the “Project of improvement of population’s drinking water supply” which was carried out by the SAI. The presentation is attached.

Agenda Item 8: Presentation by SAI India on Presentation of Audit Reports in Digital Format

Ms. Vani Sriram, SAI India made a presentation on “Presentation of Audit Reports in Digital Format” and showcased the format and features of the Report on performance audit of working of ICDs and CFSs. The presentation is attached.

Day – 2 28 May 2019

Agenda Item 9: Discussion on new Strategic Development Plan (SDP) of INTOSAI Framework for Professional Pronouncement (IFPP) 2020-2025

Mr. V. Kurian, Chair of CAS made a detailed presentation on the SDP 2020-2025. He outlined the changes/revisions to SDP 2017-2019 made by FIPP and detailed the initiatives proposed by CAS for projects to be considered for new SDP 2020-2025. The Chair also briefed about the communications received from Professional Standards Committee (PSC) and FIPP regarding criteria for selection of projects and potential areas of interest. The presentation is attached.

Mr. Kurian informed the members that the current work plan of CAS for the period 2017-2019 was approved in 14th meeting in New Delhi and it is time now to discuss and decide on the work plan for 2020-2021. The proposals in this regard were deliberated upon by the members and it was decided to continue the on-going projects 2.2 and 2.3 of SDP. In case INCOSAI meeting in Moscow in September 2019 entrusts new projects, those will of course be taken up.

As for projects outside the SDP framework, it was decided to partner with IDI on implementation of ISSAI 4000 especially on undertaking (a) cooperative compliance audits, subject to audit mandates of willing SAIs (possible areas could be sustainable procurement, data analysis tools and data visualization techniques etc.) and (b) provide support for professional education of SAI auditors (possible area could be best practices in audit planning).
Agenda Item 10: Presentation by INTOSAI Development Initiative (IDI) on the activities of IDI with regard to compliance audit and possible engagement of CAS representatives in IDI initiatives

Mr. Shofiqul Islam, Manager IDI made a presentation on “IDI-CAS collaboration for supporting ISSAI implementation” wherein he detailed the three products of IDI relating to compliance audits – Handbook, iCAT and QA tool, and the quality assurance protocol for these.

The topics of interest and needs of SAIs based on their mandate, especially in the English speaking regions was discussed and it was felt that, given the value derived from IDI in implementation guidance of ISSAI 4000, there is a need for cooperation in product development, quality assurance, blended learning programme, PESA pilot and application guidance. It was also decided that there could be further collaboration between CAS and IDI on (a) Cooperative compliance audit of sustainable procurement and (b) Best practices on audit planning in compliance audits.

Agenda Item 11: Presentation by SAI Brazil on Strategies of Data Analysis in Compliance Audit

Mr. Giuseppe de Abreu Antonaci of SAI Brazil made a presentation on “Strategies of data analysis in compliance audit”. The presentation is attached.

Agenda Item 12: Presentation by SAI China on Audit Quality Control

SAI China made a presentation on “Audit quality control”. The presentation is attached.

Agenda Item 13: Presentation by European Court of Auditors (ECA) on Quality Review Arrangements in ECA

The European Court of Auditors (ECA) made a presentation on Quality Review Arrangements in ECA. The presentation is attached.

Agenda Item 14: Presentation by SAI Mexico on Quality Control Process in Compliance Audit Reporting

SAI Mexico could not be physically present in the meeting. Therefore, its presentation on “Quality control process in compliance audit reporting” was recorded and uploaded. The presentation is attached.

Agenda Item 15: Presentation by SAI Norway on Compliance Audit of Information Security

Ms. Ingvild Gulbrandsen from SAI Norway made a presentation on “Compliance Audit of Information Security”. The presentation is attached.
Agenda Item 16: Venue of the next meeting

The Chair informed the members that earlier, SAI France and SAI Romania had kindly volunteered to host the CAS meeting in 2020 and 2021 respectively. SAI Azerbaijan had also offered to host the CAS meeting in 2020. However, since SAI France had presently expressed difficulty in hosting the meeting in 2020, the CAS Chair accepted the offer of SAI Azerbaijan to host the event in 2020 and requested it to intimate convenient time and dates for the meeting in 2020.

Concluding Session

The meeting concluded with the Chair thanking SAI Portugal for hosting the meeting and also the members for their active participation and cooperation in making the 16th CAS meeting fruitful and productive. Mr. V. Kurian, Chair of CAS informed the members that he would be retiring at the end of May 2019 and Ms. Vani Sriram will henceforth handle the CAS activities on behalf of SAI India. He hoped that the members would continue to support Ms. Vani Sriram the same way that they supported him. The members thanked Mr Kurian for steering the CAS meetings and activities appreciably and wished him the best.